

1 D. Andrew Gaona (028414)  
Austin C. Yost (034602)  
2 **COPPERSMITH BROCKELMAN PLC**  
2800 North Central Avenue, Suite 1900  
3 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
T: (602) 381-5486  
4 [agaona@cblawyers.com](mailto:agaona@cblawyers.com)  
[ayost@cblawyers.com](mailto:ayost@cblawyers.com)

5 Sambo (Bo) Dul (030313)  
6 Noah T. Gabrielsen (037161)  
Office of Arizona Governor Katie Hobbs  
7 1700 West Washington Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
8 T: (602) 542-6578  
[bdul@az.gov](mailto:bdul@az.gov)  
9 [ngabrielsen@az.gov](mailto:ngabrielsen@az.gov)

10 *Attorneys for Defendant*  
*Arizona Governor Katie Hobbs*

11 **ARIZONA SUPERIOR COURT**  
12 **MARICOPA COUNTY**

13 ARIZONA STATE SENATE, a constitutional ) No. CV2023-019899  
14 body; and WARREN PETERSEN, in his )  
15 official capacity as the President of the ) **STIPULATION TO THE ENTRY OF**  
Arizona State Senate, ) **FINAL JUDGMENT**  
16 Plaintiffs, ) (Assigned to The Hon. Scott Blaney)  
17 v. )  
18 KATIE HOBBS, in her official capacity as the )  
Governor of Arizona )  
19 Defendant. )  
20

21 Plaintiffs Warren Petersen and the Arizona Senate and Defendant Governor Katie Hobbs  
22 stipulate to the entry of the proposed final judgment attached as Exhibit 1.

23  
24  
25  
26

1 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 12th day of August, 2024.

2 **COPPERSMITH BROCKELMAN PLC**

3 By /s/ D. Andrew Gaona  
4 D. Andrew Gaona  
5 Austin C. Yost

6 **OFFICE OF ARIZONA GOVERNOR KATIE HOBBS**

7 By /s/ Sambo (Bo) Dul  
8 Sambo (Bo) Dul  
9 Noah T. Gabrielsen

10 *Attorneys for Defendant*  
11 *Arizona Governor Katie Hobbs*

12 **STATECRAFT PLLC**

13 By /s/ Thomas Basile (w/ permission)  
14 Kory Langhofer  
15 Thomas Basile

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

17 ORIGINAL efiled and served via electronic  
18 means this 12th day of August, 2024, upon:

19 The Honorable Scott Blaney  
20 c/o Erin Kelly, Judicial Assistant  
21 [Erin.Kelly@jbazmc.maricopa.gov](mailto:Erin.Kelly@jbazmc.maricopa.gov)

22 Kory Langhofer  
23 [kory@statecraftlaw.com](mailto:kory@statecraftlaw.com)  
24 Thomas Basile  
25 [tom@statecraftlaw.com](mailto:tom@statecraftlaw.com)  
26 Statecraft PLLC  
649 North Fourth Avenue, First Floor  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
*Attorneys for the Plaintiffs*

/s/ Diana J. Hanson

# **EXHIBIT 1**



1 The parties later submitted a proposed stipulated form of judgment for the Court's  
2 consideration, which the Court accepts. As a result, **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, DECREED,**  
3 **AND ADJUDGED** as follows:

4 1. The Court declares that, because the agency director positions at issue in this  
5 litigation became vacant outside of a legislative session, A.R.S. § 38-211(C) mandates that the  
6 Governor both nominate directors to those positions and transmit those nominations by the first  
7 week of the next regular legislative session. The Court finds that the Governor did not comply  
8 with these requirements for the agency director positions at issue.

9 2. This Judgment supersedes the June 5 Order, and nothing in either the June 5  
10 Order or this Judgment may be construed as a ruling on the validity or legality of the  
11 appointment of Executive Deputy Directors for the agencies at issue or any actions taken by  
12 those deputy directors pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-461.

13 3. The Governor and Senate reached a mutually acceptable agreement under which  
14 the Governor will nominate and transmit nominations for the agency director positions at issue  
15 and the parties agree that A.R.S. § 38-211(E)'s one-year time period starts on the date of those  
16 new nominations. The parties also agree that each side will bear their own attorneys' fees and  
17 costs. Accordingly, there is no need for further proceedings or a ruling from this Court on the  
18 Senate's request for mandamus and injunctive relief.

19 4. No further matters remain pending before the Court, and thus the Court enters  
20 this final judgment under Rule 54(c), Ariz. R. Civ. P.

21 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_  
22

23 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 The Honorable Scott Blaney  
25 Maricopa County Superior Court  
26